



**TEMPE HISTORIC
PRESERVATION
COMMISSION**

Anne Bilsbarrow
Elias Y. Esquer
Bob Gasser, Chair
Dan Killoren
Charlië Lee, Alternate
Kriste Melcher
Ann Patterson
Liz Wilson, Vice-Chair

**TEMPE HISTORIC
PRESERVATION
OFFICE**

Amy Douglass
Hunter Hansen
Wm. "Billy" Kiser
Joe Nucci
John Southard
Mark Vinson

The City of Tempe is a
Certified Local Government,
in association with the United
States Department of the
Interior / National Park Service

Tempe Historic
Preservation Office
Community Development
Department
21 East 6th Street, Suite 208
P.O. Box 5002
Tempe, AZ 85280

480.350.8028
8579 FAX; 8913TDD



Tempe Historic Preservation Commission [Tempe HPC]

MEETING MINUTES

Meeting Date: Thursday, January 14, 2010

Location: Hatton Hall, 34 East Seventh Street

Commissioners

Present: Elias Y. Esquer
Bob Gasser
Dan Killoren
Kriste Melcher
Ann Patterson
Liz Wilson

Alternates

Charlie Lee

Present:

Staff Present: Abrahamson, Steve; Branom, Michael; Douglass, Amy; Hansen, Hallman, Hugh; Hunter, Kiser, Billy; Messer, Chris; Nucci, O'Melia, Kevin; Joe; Salomone, Chris; Southard, John; Vinson, Mark

Public Present: Amorosi, Phil 85281; Bilsbarrow, Matthew 85282; Conway, Jacqueline 85281; Conway, Matthew 85281; Douglass, Phill 85281; Enz, Betty 85282; Enz, Dick 85282; Garrison, Jim (SHPO); Gitlis, Karyn 85281; Graham, Bob (MDG); Gutierrez, Sara 85281; Hallam, Nathan 85282; Higgins, Chris 85282; Hoffman, Beth 85281; Linoff, Vic (THMAB); Marshak, Bob 85283; Marshak, Donna 85283; Minet, John 85281; Roach, Lisa 85281; Sandstedt, Ginny 85281; Sandstedt, Robert 85281; Sieffer, Stu 85281; Solliday, Scott (ACS); Strength, Randy 85281; Szuter, Chris (ASU) Vargas, Victoria (ACS); Visuela, Mary 85281; Wilson, Woody 85281; Yates, Edwarda 85282; Yates, Justine 85281; Yates, Phillip 85281

Call to Order: 6:00 PM, Bob Gasser, Chair

1. Call to Audience

- Phil Amorosi, Hudson Manor Neighborhood Association, requested interim evaluation of neighborhood based on Solliday's 2001 Post-War Survey which listed Hudson Manor as a 2nd Tier candidate
CONSENSUS: For staff to make formal presentation to HMNA on Tempe's Preservation Program / designation process at February HMNA meeting

2. Approval of HPC Minutes: 12/10/09 Tempe HPC meeting

MOTION: TO APPROVE THE 12/10/09 MINUTES AS WRITTEN [LW], SECOND [CL]; **APPROVED:** UNANIMOUSLY, [6-0].

3. Public Hearing Douglass/Gitlis House Historic Designation & Listing

TCC§14A-4 Public Hearing for historic 1935 Douglass/Gitlis House at 1206 S. Ash Ave.

- Opening legal narrative read into record
- SSR format is great improvement; works well
- Report helps HPC evaluate impact of proposed future changes; make recommendations based on significance
- One of two reminding wood-frame structures from this (pre-1940) time period
- Field work for MANA not yet complete; but important to emphasize we're targeting Maple-Ash for designations
- Garage moved further back on property
- Modifications on west [rear] side include an extension and dormer added
- South side addition of bathroom with similar facing which changed the roofline; it is a bowed glass block wall which = obvious new addition
- New addition[s] don't affect massing of the house; none detract from what makes house eligible

- Character of the property is retained and preserved
- Jim Garrison, SHPO: Due to rarity of pre-1941 properties in Tempe; because modifications done to Sec. of the Interior's Standards this is a good case study to adapt a house with integrity in place; great example of how you make changes
- PUBLIC COMMENT: just wanted to speak for it (in favor of designation)
- PUBLIC COMMENT: please consider 'Conservation Areas' throughout Tempe at a future date; support current designation
- General call for public support from neighbors within area = 31 people; within MANA = 8 property owners

MOTION: THAT THE TEMPE HPC APPROVE THE NOMINATION AND RECOMMEND THAT THE DOUGLASS/GITLIS RESIDENCE BE DESIGNATED HISTORIC AND LISTED IN THE TEMPE HISTORIC PROPERTY REGISTER [KM], SECOND [AP]

APPROVED: UNANIMOUSLY, [7-0].

[AGENDA REORDERED AT THE DISCRETION OF THE CHAIR]

7. Tempe Pass-thru Grant from SHPO (SRP-MIC match)

John Southard update on Survey & Inventory for Hudson Manor Neighborhood

- Summary of 2001 Post-WWII survey which included Hudson Manor as a 'Tier 2' candidate; south side of Apache Blvd / east Dorsey Lane with 143 residential parcels; built between 1948-1954
- 2001 survey looked for a high degree of integrity; currently looking to align interpretation with SHPO policy
- Survey underway to recognize built-in flexibility and consider properties contributing with modifications consistent with original intention of developer / builders for expansion
- The consensus is an overview presentation to the Hudson Manor Neighborhood Assoc. is the best place to begin
- Previous map with 143 parcels = 'if it had modifications, it probably wasn't eligible' but now consideration is aligned with SHPO and Sec. of the Interior's Standards which would probably add about 30-40% of the properties for consideration
- Initial neighborhood overview meeting will be scheduled for February 2010

4. Discuss and Consider Preservation Activities with Mayor Hugh Hallman

Commission dialog with Mayor Hallman re: Tempe Historic Property Register listing for: Hayden Flour Mill + Silos; Sandra Day O'Connor House; Tempe Municipal Building (City Hall); National Register Nomination for Tempe (Hayden) Butte; Future Bond Issue for Historic Preservation; Utility Bill Contributions for Historic Preservation; Mayor's Preservation Vision; Commission Issues.

- Mayor started political career in Tempe on Hackett House with 501(c)(3) in conjunction with the City's Centennial (1871-1971) with early members of Tempe Historical Society
- Preservation projects as Mayor included Tempe National Bank Building, Tempe Beach Park, Pyle House, Hayden Flour Mill + Silos and Tempe (Hayden) Butte Park Preserve including repatriation agreement with Native Americans.
- Any work we are doing, any work I have done, carries on in the footsteps of Susan Harter who was the first to say we shouldn't lose old buildings.
- Michael Monti's ongoing work is important to all of us.
- Connectivity to what we have, what's important is essential; preserving it helps us be connected to what we were and who we are
- "You are preserving our soul – why we exist here as a community."
- Evoke the SRP-MIC's "7G" ethic which is the 7 generations rule / obligation to community coming after us
- We need to have patience, as this is expensive work we are doing = importance of groups like the Tempe Preservation Foundation
- Gonzalez-Martinez House is in horrible shape; confusing mess of ownership
- Butte is sacred to those who are our very good neighbors
- Suggestion to bring Edie Eisendrath in from Flagstaff to partner on project(s)
- Presentation by Mayor to Bob Gasser of photograph from the 'Thank You' brunch with Justice Sandra Day O'Connor

5. Eisendrath House Adaptive Reuse Design Review

Motley Design Group (Bob Graham) preliminary design submittal

- 'Preservation Perspectives' being conducted to outline choices being made to determine options
- LEED Certification for HP buildings are rare, but being considered for Carl Hayden Center for Sustainability Campus
- Q: Period of Significance 1930 – just one year? A: Possibly the building was relatively stable while Eisendrath family was there; NRN Criteria 'C' for architect = requires year it was built
- Barkers acquired property in 1938 = A/C added; second-story patio enclosed
- Q: Are there currently electric lines dangling all over the place; has the swimming pool been enclosed? A: We will be installing all-new electrical system to meet code requirements which will be accomplished by fishing wires through plumbing + mechanical systems.
- Variable-volume refrigerant line systems will be installed which are very efficient systems and easily hidden

- Most important goals relate to water efficiency; saving rainwater in cistern [re-excavate pool?] would be an effective adaptive re-use
- Q: ADA parking area? A: Both at the top and the bottom of the site; also meeting ADA concerns on one small window which requires newly accessible fire exit door in Library Room which will be a newly accessible office, along with all of the first floor
- Q: Adobe condition? A: It depends. Two primary concerns: 1.) living room, and 2.) main hallway near glass doors; some reinforcement of floors and vigas required.
- Q: Plant palette? A: Needs to be to the Period of Significance; photos exist to the 1950s/60s.
- Q: Free-standing garage? A: Garage roof has started to cave-in; of the existing 5 or 6 vigas, 3 or 4 are rotted. Need garage as meeting space; we've gone back-and-forth on reconstruction or trying to save the walls.
- Q: Can garage be used as greenhouse / plants? A: We need space for formal meeting space.
- Q: Interesting rough hand-trowled exterior plaster finish? A: Should be hand-matched; colors we're proposing are colors matched and found on the building.
- Q: Seismic considerations? A: May acquire variance for City's requirements.
- Q: Can both M/W restrooms be off the same corridor? A: Preferred to be in once place, but had to add showers for green credits so that's not possible; will improve directional signage for restrooms
- Q: Foam roofing? A: Process requires addition of plywood structure, then adding foam roof back on top of it.

MOTION: TO APPROVE PRELIMINARY DRAWINGS TO GO TO DRC FOR REVIEW [AP], SECOND [LW].

APPROVED: UNANIMOUSLY, [7-0].

- Site plan for security fencing proposed as temporary fencing; permanent fence to be installed after construction
- Q: Interpretive element? A: Signage for house and landscape hasn't been determined yet.

"Certificate of Thanks" signed by Mayor and Historic Preservation Officer presented to Dan Killoren, Donna Marshak and Stu Siefer for their service to the community on the HPC.

6. Tempe Pass-thru Grant from SHPO (SRP-MIC match)

Billy Kiser update on National Register Nomination for Tempe (Hayden) Butte

- Pre-history of the Butte basis for NRN
- Reviewed survey of existing petroglyphs / contextual archeology on Butte
- Half of nomination form filled-out; conferring with others for narrative components of NRN; draft completed within the month
- Looking for comparable NRNs for basis; SHPO: Tumamock Hill in Tucson
- Also consider pre-historic, agricultural, walls, etc.; will consider all options in due time
- Addressed all issues under Criteria 'D'
- Q: Boundary? A: 1180' contour line.

8. Discuss and Consider HPC Actions at Ad Hoc and Council Committees

- Gasser update on Papago Park Master Plan Committee Ad Hoc Committee – Draft master plan due out next week

ONSENSUS: To no longer provide itemized list of Ad Hoc and Council Committee updates on agenda.

To invite four City Council candidates to February meeting and make new assignments for Council Liaisons at next meeting.

9. Discuss and Consider Chair / Staff Updates:

- RAHD Design Guidelines – presentation of final document 2/11/2010

10. Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items

- Member Announcements
- Staff Announcements – call for volunteers from audience to serve on the HPC
- Next HPC Meeting Date Thursday, 02/11/2010 6:00 p.m. Hatton Hall
 - ASU Historic Preservation Update, Dr. Patricia Olson

Adjourn

Meeting adjourned at 8:22 PM

Minutes scheduled for Tempe HPC approval on 02/11/2010.



Bob Gasser, Chair

FREQUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS OR ACRONYMS

CDD – City of Tempe Community Development Department: Established February 15, 2005, by City Manager Will Manley the CDD consists of six divisions; Economic Development, Housing Services, Redevelopment, Neighborhood Enhancement, Rio Salado/Town Lake, and Special Projects, as well as the Community Design Studio / City Architect. The Tempe Historic Preservation Office is an agency of the Special Projects Division.

CLG – Certified Local Government: In 1980, Congress established a framework for local preservation programs through an amendment to the National Historic Preservation Act empowering Arizona cities and counties to become Certified Local Governments (CLGs). Once certified, these entities are eligible for specialized assistance and funds for developing their own local preservation programs and entitled to comment on NR and other SHPO activities within their boundaries. The City of Tempe became a CLG in 1995.

DDA – Development & Disposition Agreement: a redevelopment contract between the City and one or more developers or redevelopers specifying terms and conditions for construction or reconstruction.

DSD – City of Tempe Development Services Department: dealing with Building Safety, Land Use, Planning and Zoning

DRC – City of Tempe Development Review Commission: volunteer board advising Mayor and Council on matters related to the built environment and administration of General Plan 2030 and the Zoning and Development Code.

HPAC – Historic Preservation Advisory Committee: Arizona State Parks is governed by the State Parks Board and receives direction and oversight from several advisory committees and groups such as the Historic Preservation Advisory Committee.

IEBC – International Existing Building Code: adopted by Tempe City Council by Ordinance No. 2005.89 on December 1, 2005, as part of the code body promulgated by the International Code Council, provides means for preservation of existing Tempe building inventory through reasonable and feasible code processes.

IRS – Issue Review Session: informal Mayor and Council public meeting where members of the public may come forward and talk with City Council during the “Call to the Audience” prior to regular Council meetings.

PAD – Planned Area Development: site plan overlay to define development standards for a specific project.

SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office: a division of Arizona State Parks, responsible for the identification, evaluation, and protection of Arizona's prehistoric and historic cultural resources; established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.

SRP-MIC – Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community: created by Executive Order on June 14, 1879 by President Rutherford B. Hayes, the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRPMIC) is located in Maricopa County, aside the boundaries of Mesa, Tempe, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills and metropolitan Phoenix.

Tempe HPC – Tempe Historic Preservation Commission: Created by Ordinance 95.35, adopted November 9, 1995. Members serve three year terms with the exception of the initial appointments; charged with administering the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance and Plan, as well as advising Mayor / Council on all matters related to historic preservation

Tempe HPF – Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation: A private nonprofit corporation established in 2005, Mission Statement 02.02.06 “The Tempe HPF advocates preserving Tempe’s at-risk historic properties and supporting worthy preservation projects through education, community participation, and fundraising.”

Tempe HPO – Tempe Historic Preservation Office: Responsible for the identification and conservation of Tempe’s prehistoric and historic cultural resources, the Office uses Federal, state, and city funding for the historic preservation program and assists owners of historic properties with grant applications, property maintenance, and preservation activities; provides staff support to the Tempe HPC.

THM – Tempe Historical Museum: Located at 809 E. Southern Avenue in Tempe, the Tempe Historical Museum is a center where the community comes together to celebrate Tempe's past and ponder the future. Permanent and changing exhibits, educational programs, and research projects generally focus on some aspect of Tempe's history within the context of state and national events.

TOD – Tempe Transportation Overlay District: placed to encourage appropriate land development and redevelopment consistent with and complementary to the community’s focused investment in transit, bicycle, and pedestrian infrastructure in certain geographic areas of the City; typically in association with the light rail.

ZDC – Zoning & Development Code: Adopted by Mayor and Council on January 20, 2005, effective February 22, 2005, the ZDC implements Tempe General Plan 2030 by encouraging creative development of the built environment in order to build a community that promotes the livability and uniqueness of Tempe; establishes zoning districts and development standards.